Interim Evaluation Nr. R/SK/TF/ESC/06.003

This Project is co-funded by the EUROPEAN UNION



Transition Facility

2004/016-764.04.02 Development of Improved Regional Structures for the Implementation of the Anti-discrimination *acquis*

2004/016-764.04.01 Strengthening of Administrative Capacities in the Field of Gender Mainstreaming

2005/017-464.05.01 Creation of National Indicators in the Field of Poverty and Social Exclusion (the Tertiary Indicators)

2005/017-464.05.02 Improvement of Working Time in the Health Sector

2005/017-464.04.01 Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of the State Institute for Drug Control as regards Medicinal Products for Human Use

2005/017-464.04.03 Strengthening of National Monitoring of Drugs and Drug Abuse

2005/017-464.04.02 Improvement of the Safety, Quality, Availability of Organs, Tissues and Cells for Transplantation in the Slovak Republic

Interim Evaluation of the European Union Transition Facility

The Slovak Republic

Sector: Economic and Social Cohesion

Author:



in consortium with



Date: 8 March 2007

This report has been prepared as a result of an independent evaluation by CEEN Economic Project and Policy Consulting and Euroformes being contracted under the Transition Facility programme. The views expressed are those of the contractors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Government Office of the Slovak Republic.



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Slovak Republic – Economic and Social Cohesion

Monitoring Report: M/SR/ESC/06013 issued on 2 November 2006 Interim Evaluation Report: R/SK/TF/ESC/06.003

This Executive Summary covers the Transition Facility assistance under the following programmes/components:

- □ Human Resource Development
- Health Care.

A) Objectives and Scope

The goal of this Interim Evaluation is to review the Transition Facility assistance to Slovakia under the Economic and Social Cohesion Monitoring Sector. The EU support to Slovakia represents the total allocation of almost 3.3 M \in for years 2004 and 2005, including co-financing. For evaluation purposes the standard five criteria have been used, namely relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact¹.

B) Evaluation Results

They support the priority areas as defined in the EU and national policy documents, the corresponding strategies and action plans, such as the Government Action Plan for the Prevention of All Forms of Discrimination, the Fight against Drugs, Charter of Human Rights, the Joint Memorandum of Social Inclusion, the National Action Plan for Social Inclusion, and Gender Mainstreaming Strategy. Designs of some interventions were clearly over-ambitious, like that for the 2004 Gender Mainstreaming, with a number of activities planned for a broad audience of beneficiaries and a heavy need for a strong logistical support. Some of the projects, for instance the 2005 Working Time, 2005 Transplantations or Monitoring of Drugs are rather demanding as regards sequencing of the individual subprojects or logistics. The quality of the project documentation was mostly satisfactory, including the definition of the relevant objectives, however, with some room for improvement in the case of the corresponding indicators of achievement.

Efficiency of the evaluated programmes shows mixed results. The low disbursement rate – only 10 percent for the Sector – is rather worrying. Most of the projects have suffered again from delays at their pre-implementation phase due to lengthy approval of the project documentation. Also there might be a scope for an improvement of efficiency under the 2004 Anti-discrimination project, which could benefit from a better organisation and more

1

¹ Relevance relates to the project's design and concerns to the extent to which its objectives address real needs. Efficiency concerns how well activities have transformed inputs into outputs. Effectiveness assesses whether the project's purposes have been achieved. Sustainability evaluates whether project outcomes are likely to continue after external funding ends. Impact denotes the relationship between the project's purpose and overall objectives.

active cooperation and communication within the project team. On the other hand, the evaluated projects show good results or perspectives in transformation of individual activities into results. Due to improved internal co-operation within the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family for the 2005 National Indicators, drafting the tendering documentation involving the relevant key beneficiaries has been developed. On the other hand some negative implications of the delegation of project management responsibilities from the Ministry of Health to the subordinated specialist institutions have been reported, as capacities of top medical specialists are very limited. Moreover, some concerns exist with regard to implementation of all the planned activities of the 2005 Transplantations project, especially the training ones due to the lack of resources to cover all the related costs.

Effectiveness Even at the early stage of implementation or the pre-implementation phase, projects' designs give good chances for most of the projects to contribute to their respective Immediate Objectives, such as strengthening the institutional and administrative capacities of the Slovak National Center for Human Rights, introduction of the Quality Management System in the health sectors, i.e. for human resources, transplantations or establishment of the National Reference Laboratory for medical toxicology. The first tangible results were delivered by the 2004 Anti-discrimination project, such as the needs assessment and the publication of two articles. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming assistance has already achieved the planned objectives, such as the development of the global communication strategy, including the Gender Website or the production of the relevant gender methodology.

Sustainability Early observations of sustainability show mixed results. Sustainability of the 2004 Anti-discrimination project will be a challenge, if financing of the foreseen establishment of 7 regional offices of the Slovak National Center for Human Rights is not secured after the project ends. Furthermore, the Gender Website under the 2004 Gender Mainstreaming to be fully sustainable requires a regular maintenance to disseminate updated information on the implementation of the mainstreaming policy. Also the complementary funding for the 2005 Transplantations project was not secured at the time of the Report. On the other hand the future National Reference Laboratory for the 2005 Monitoring of Drugs project possesses a stable and experienced staff to secure sustainability of the Transition Facility intervention.

No big concerns exist for the *impact* of the evaluated projects, as these should contribute to the achievement of their overall objectives. The 2004 Anti-discrimination project may contribute to a gradual change of mentality of people by informing and making them aware about their rights through the regional offices of the Slovak National Center for Human Rights. For the 2004 Gender Mainstreaming project we can expect a positive impact, as political acceptance exists for the gender quality agenda, which has been also officially declared in the new Policy Manifesto. The 2005 National Indicators project, once successfully implemented, will definitely have an impact on the improvement of monitoring framework of the social inclusion process. Also the health sub-sector interventions should have a concrete impact, for instance on the improved working time organisation, an increased free movement of pharmaceuticals, enhanced quality and safety of donations for transplantations or improved monitoring of Drug Related Deaths.

C) Recommendations and Rating

Slovak National Center for Human Rights and Office of Government

• The Slovak National Center for Human Rights and the Section of Human Rights and Minorities of the Office of Government should, together with the contractor, explore possibilities for future financing of the 7 regional offices, including a partial financing from the state budget in the initial years of the existence of the regional offices, where the Office of Government should provide policy assistance and support. The Slovak National Center for Human Rights should consequently take corresponding actions in this area, i.e. approach the Ministry of Finance. Moreover, training on acquisition of funds and preparation of proposals for projects financed from Structural Funds should be developed and given to the representatives of the regional offices as a part of the training activity of the project.

Ministry of Health SR

- The Ministry of Health together with the beneficiaries of the 2005 Transplantations project should secure financial resources to cover costs of the complementary equipment (such as the server) and also maintenance costs of the Software developed under the Transition Facility to secure sustainability of the project's outputs.
- The Ministry of Health together with the beneficiaries of the 2005 Transplantation project should allocate adequate financial resources to secure participation at training activities for trainees from all of Slovakia.

Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family

- The Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family should secure the maintenance of the Gender Website developed under the 2004 Transition Facility in order to disseminate the updated information on the implementation of the gender mainstreaming policy
- The Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family should introduce a systematic training on gender mainstreaming into the general training system of civil servants, as well as the public administration staff using also the strategic and methodological documents created at the Focal Points under the 2004 Transition Facility assistance.

Rating

	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability	Impact	Verbal Rating
Human Resource	es Development					
2004/016-	1	1	1	1	1	C
764.04.02	1	-1	1	-1	1	3

Anti-						
discrimination						
2004/016-						
764.04.01						
Gender	1	1	1	1	1	S
Mainstreaming						
2005/017-						
464.05.01						
National	1	1	0	1	1	S
Indicators						
Health Care						
2005/017-						
464.05.02	2	0	0	0	1	S
Working Time	-	· ·	· ·	Ü	1	5
2005/017-						
464.04.01			_			
Medicinal	1	0	0	0	1	S
Products						
2005/017-						
464.04.03						
Monitoring of	1	0	0	0	1	S
Drugs						
2005/017-						
464.04.02	1	-1	1	-1	1	S
Transplantations						
Total for the ESC Sector	1	0	1	0	1	S

Unacceptable	Poor	Sufficient/ adequate or no rating possible	Good	Excellent
-2	-1	0	+1	+2

Highly Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	No rating possible	Satisfactory	Highly satisfactory
HU	U	N/A	S	HS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXEC	UTIVE SUMMARY	I
TABL	E OF CONTENTS	1
PREF	ACE	2
GLOS	SARY OF ACRONYMS	4
MAIN	REPORT	6
FINAN	NCIAL AND CONTRACTUAL DATA OF THE SECTOR ECONOMIC AND SOC	IAL
СОН	IESION	6
1.SEC	TORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION	8
1.1 Sı	ECTORAL BACKGROUND	8
1.2	SCOPE OF EVALUATION	8
2.EVA	LUATION RESULTS	10
2.1.	RELEVANCE	10
2.2.	EFFICIENCY	12
2.3.	EFFECTIVENESS	14
2.4.	SUSTAINABILITY	16
2.5.	IMPACT	
2.6	SPECIFIC ISSUES	19
3. CON	NCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	20
ANNE	X 1 INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT	27
ANNE	X 2 LIST OF INTERVIEWS	29
ANNE	X 3 LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION	31
ANNE	X 4 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS INTERIM EVALUATION	32
ANNE	X 5 SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION	34
ANNF	EX 6 DISSENTING VIEWS	36

PREFACE

This Interim Evaluation Report covers Transition Facility assistance to the Economic and Social Cohesion sector in Slovakia under the following programmes:

2004/016-764.04.02 Development of Improved Regional Structures for the Implementation of the Anti-discrimination *acquis*; 2004/016-764.04.01 Strengthening of Administrative Capacities in the Field of Gender Mainstreaming; 2005/017-464.05.01 Creation of National Indicators in the Field of Poverty and Social Exclusion (the Tertiary Indicators); 2005/017-464.05.02 Improvement of Working Time in the Health Sector; 2005/017-464.04.01 Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of the State Institute for Drug Control as regards Medicinal Products for Human Use; 2005/017-464.04.03 Strengthening of National Monitoring of Drugs and Drug Abuse and 2005/017-464.04.02 Improvement of the Safety, Quality, Availability of Organs, Tissues and Cells for Transplantation in the Slovak Republic

This Interim Evaluation Report has been prepared by CEEN Economic Project and Policy Consulting GmbH and Euroformes s.r.o² during the period from November 2006 to January 2007 and reflects the situation at 22 January 2007, the cut-off date for the Report. The factual basis is provided by the Monitoring Report M/SR/ESC/06013 prepared by the Aid Coordination unit of the Office of the Government, covering the period from March to August 2006 and issued on 2 November 2006. Other findings are based on analysis of formal Programme documentation, interviews with the main parties and published material.

The Interim Evaluation Report examines the progress of the programmes towards the objectives stated in the formal programming documents, i.e. Project Fiches. The report is intended to provide management information for the benefit of the Joint Monitoring Committee and other involved parties. It draws conclusions and puts forward Recommendations. It provides a general assessment of programmes or components under consideration and included in the corresponding Sectoral Monitoring Report.

Comments have been requested on the draft Report from the following parties:

Party invited	Comments received
Office of the Government/Aid Co-ordination Unit	yes
Ministry of Finance/Central Finance and Contracting	yes
Unit	
Ministry of Finance/National Fund	yes
Office of the Government/Section of Human Rights	yes
and Minorities	
Ministry of Health SR	yes/
Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family	yes

_

² Authors: Viera Spanikova and Viera Gazikova, Interim Evaluation Cell CEEN/Euroformes and Ms Valeria Kubalova, Short-term Technical Specialist. The Report was reviewed by the CEEN Headquarters in Vienna

Where possible, the Evaluators have integrated the comments received into the Report. Dissenting views are included in the Annex 6.

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

ACU Aid Co-ordination Unit

CFCU Central Finance and Contracting Unit
CMR Comprehensive Monitoring Report
DFGP Department of Family and Gender Policy

DPF Detailed Project Fiche DRD Drug Related Deaths

ESC Economic and Social Cohesion

EMCDDA European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction

EU European Union
FAD Fight against Drugs
FM Financing Memorandum

GS Grant Scheme

GMC Gender Mainstreaming Committee

HC Health Care

HRD Human Resource Development

HTU Higher Territorial Units

HW Hardware

Indicator of Achievement IA **Institutional Building** IΒ IΕ Interim Evaluation Intermediate Objective IO **Inception Report** IR Information System IS IT Information Technology **JMC** Joint Monitoring Committee M&E Monitoring and Evaluation Ministry of Finance MoF MoH Ministry of Health Ministry of Interior MoI

MoLSAF Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family

Ministry of Justice

MoU Memorandum of Understanding

MS Member State NAP National Action Plan

NGO Non-governmental Organisation
NRL National Reference Laboratory

OoG Office of Government

PF Project Fiche

MoJ

QMS Quality Management System
RTA Resident Twinning Adviser
SMU Slovak Medical University

SNCHR Slovak National Center for Human Rights

SC Steering Committee

SIDC State Institute for Drug Control

SILC Statistics on Income and Living Conditions SMSC Sectoral Monitoring Sub-Committee

SOSR Statistical Office of the SR SPO Senior Programme Officer

SR Slovak Republic SW Software

TA Technical Assistance
TF Transition Facility

ToR Terms of Reference ToT Training of Trainers

TW Twinning TWL Twinning Light

UIBF Unallocated Institution Building Facility

WO Wider Objective

MAIN REPORT

FINANCIAL AND CONTRACTUAL DATA OF THE SECTOR ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COHESION

				Contract		Transition	n Facility S	upport	C	o-financin	g
Project Number	Title	Beneficiary	Start of Contract	Finish of the Contract /Expiry of Contracting	Expiry of Disbursement	Allocated €	com %	dis %	Allocated €	com %	dis %
COMPONENT	OMPONENT 1 : HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT										
2004/016- 764.04.02	Development of Improved Regional Structures for the Implementation of the Anti- discrimination acquis	OoG/SHRM	10/10/2006	15/12/2006	15/12/2007	690,000	99.28	0.00	100,000	0.00	0.00
	Technical Assistance		10/10/2006	15/12/2006	15/12/2007	690,000	99.28	0.00	100,000	0.00	0.00
2004/016- 764.04.01	Strengthening Administrative Capacities in the Field of Gender Mainstreaming	MoLSAF	19/10/2005	30/11/2006	15/12/2007	500,000	100,00%	62,52%	-	-	_
	Twinning		19/10/2005	30/11/2006	15/12/2007	500,000	100,00%	62,52%	-	-	-
2005/017- 464.05.01	Creation of National Indicators in the Field of Poverty and social Exclusion (the Tertiary Indicators)	MoLSAF	-	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	250,000	0,00%	0,00%	-	-	-
	Technical Assistance		-	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	250,000	0%	0%	-	_	_
COMPONENT	COMPONENT 2 : HEALTH CARE										
2005/017-	Improvement of Working Time in the Health Sector	МоН	_	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	200,000	0.00	0.00	-	-	-
464.05.02	Twinning Light		-	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	200,000	0.00	0.00	-	-	-

2005/017- 464.04.01	Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of the State Institute for Drug Control as regards Medicinal Products for Human Use	МоН	-	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	150,000	0.00	0.00	-	-	-
	Twinning Light		-	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	150,000	0.00	0.00	-	-	-
2005/017- 464.04.02	Improvement of the Safety, Quality and Availability of Organs, Tissues and Cells for Transplantation		04/12/2006	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	850,000	58.82	0.00	-	-	-
	Twinning		04/12/2006	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	500,000	100.00	0.00	_	_	_
	Technical Assistance		_	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	350,000	0.00	0.00	_	_	_
2005/017- 464.04.03	Strengthening of National Monitoring of Drugs and Drugs Abuse		_	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	400,000	0.00	0.00	100,000	0.00	0.00
404.04.03	Twinning Light Project		-	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	120,000	0.00	0.00	_	_	_
	Supply		_	15/12/2007	15/12/2008	280,000	0.00	0.00	100,000	0.00	0.00
	Total for the Sector					3.040,000	55.40	10.3	200,000	0.00	0.00

Source: Perseus by cut-off date 22 January 2007.

1. SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION

1.1 Sectoral Background

1. This Interim Evaluation (IE) Report is the first of the series of reports to cover the Transition Facility (TF) assistance to Slovakia, namely the Economic and Social Cohesions (ESC) Sector, one of the three existing monitoring sectors for the TF and Phare support in the Slovak Republic (SR). The programmes under review are closely linked to the respective EU documents, such as the 2003 Country Monitoring Report (CMR), the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on the TF 2004 – 2006 Implementation and other sector-related documents, such as the Fight against Drugs (FAD), Charter of Human Rights, the Joint Memorandum of Social Inclusion, National Action Plan for Social Inclusion, Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, and the Government Action Plan for the Prevention of All Forms of Discrimination.

1.2 Scope of Evaluation

- 2. The ESC monitoring sector for the TF part covers several 2004 and 2005 projects, which were split for the evaluation purposes into the following two Components:
- □ Human Resource Development (HRD)
- □ Health Care (HC).

1.2.1 Performance of Activities³

Component 1 Human Resource Development

2004/016-764.04.02 Development of Improved Regional Structures for the Implementation of the Anti-discrimination acquis; 2004/016-764.04.01 Strengthening of Administrative Capacities in the Field of Gender Mainstreaming and; 2005/017-464.05.01 Creation of National Indicators in the Field of Poverty and Social Exclusion (the Tertiary Indicators)

Activities and Outputs

3. The 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis provides support to the Slovak National Center for Human Rights (SNCHR) in strengthening its institutional and administrative capacities through the establishment of a fully functional network of 7 regional offices. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming assistance was aimed at strengthening of administrative capacities in the field of gender mainstreaming and development of the methodology for implementation of gender mainstreaming principles in practise. The 2005 National Indicators project is focused on improvement of monitoring framework for the assessment of the social inclusion process.

Effects

4. The 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis project has progressed with the execution of the regional level needs assessment and a selection of representatives of the 7 regional offices.

³ For more detailed information on activities, outputs and effects, please see Annex 5

These activities, which will be followed by training, i.e. transfer of relevant know-how and experience to the regional offices, should strengthen the institutional and administrative capacity of the SNCHR. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming, which has been completed in November last year, has managed to produce a number of tangible outputs under the 3 key components of the Twinning (TW) project. The global communication strategy was designed, published and implemented. Also the Gender Website (www.gender.gov.sk) was fully operational at the time of this IE. The good practice guide and training materials were designed, printed and disseminated to all training participants. Full effects from the 2004 gender intervention should materialise once the National Action Plan (NAP) co-drafted by the Member States (MS) experts is approved by the Government later this year. For the 2005 National Indicators project no effects can be observed yet, due to its pre-implementation phase and slow progress in the preparation of the Terms of Reference (ToR) from the side of the Ministry of Labour, social Affairs and Family (MoLSAF).

Component 2 Health Care

2005/017-464.05.02 Improvement of Working Time in the Health Sector; 2005/017-464.04.01 Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of the State Institute for Drug Control as regards Medicinal Products for Human Use; 2005/017-464.04.02 Improvement of the Safety, Quality, Availability of Organs, Tissues and Cells for Transplantation in the Slovak Republic and

2005/017-464.04.03 Strengthening of National Monitoring of Drugs and Drug Abuse

Activities and Outputs

5. The <u>2005 Working Time</u> has the intention to reinforce the organisation and utilisation of health professional capacities throughout Slovakia via provision of a range of training and the preparation of a manual. The <u>2005 Administrative Capacity</u> project supports the State Institute for Drug Control (SIDC) in the process of preparation of the Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs that should be prepared independently, at a high quality level and in line with the EC legislation and requirements. The <u>2005 Transplantations</u> assistance aims mostly at implementation of quality management in the field of organ transplantation. The <u>2005 Monitoring of Drugs project</u> focuses on strengthening the monitoring and reporting capacities in the field of Drug Related Deaths (DRD).

Effects

6. No concrete effects can be reported from the 2005 projects due to their pre-implementation phase. Only the 2005 Transplantations project, its TW part was at the inception stage at the time of this IE. However, the quality of the project's design gives reason for optimism in respect of its contribution to the respective objectives, especially in the area of working time, preparation of the Assessment Reports and safety of donation.

2. EVALUATION RESULTS

2.1. Relevance

Component 1 Human Resource Development

7. The 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis project is relevant in its intention to build up a functional network of the regional centers that should increase capacities of the SNCHR to monitor and enforce the principle of equal treatment at the regional level. The relevance is determined by both the EU and the national documents. Significant institutional development is needed for the SNCHR to execute its duties as the Equality Body according to the Council Directive 2000/43/EC, emphasised also in the CMR of November 2003. This need is confirmed also by the Government Action Plan for the Prevention of All Forms of Discrimination for the years 2006-2008⁴. An important aspect of the Action Plan in the area of discrimination is that the SNCHR has a complex overview of the specifics of discrimination in the whole of Slovakia.

8. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming assistance was clearly relevant, as it was linked to the articles of the EC Treaty and the Charter of Fundamental Rights, as well as a number of directives and other acts dealing with the implementation of the gender equality within the EU. The TW project was justified in terms of needs, and it correctly addresses both the low capacity of the existing national administrative structure in charge of the equal opportunities policy for women and men at the Department of Family and Gender Policy (DFGP) at the MoLSAF, as well as other relevant actors within the individual ministries, regional selfgovernments representatives, Non-governmental Organisations (NGO), etc. Moreover, the lack of methodology to implement gender-mainstreaming principles in practise was required to be developed to comply with the EC regulations. Also the setting up of the gender mainstreaming co-ordination institutional body and enhancing the implementation capacities were highly advisable in terms of EU best practice. The TW contract reflected the quality of the intervention logic, provided relevant and realistic Indicators of Achievements (IA) on the level of overall objectives and mandatory results. An addendum to the TW contract was approved (on designing the NAP instead of the actual creation of the Gender Mainstreaming Committee (GMC)) to reflect the changes in circumstances in the new political context, which shows the flexibility of the design and contributes to satisfactory results in the relevance criterion.

9. The TF support under the 2005 National Indicators seems to be relevant, as it is aligned with the new EU Regulation concerning the Community Statistics on Income and Living Conditions (EU-SILC), which was transposed into Slovak legislation before the accession. The relevance of the project, when assessed at the time of this IE and compared to the original design shows good results. Slovakia still misses its own national indicators that would correctly show the real state of poverty and social exclusion and would fully reflect the specific policy measures.

_

⁴ The actual Action Plan is based on that for the period 2004-2005, approved on May 13, 2004 by the Government resolution No. 446.

Therefore, the national indicators (specific for Slovakia), which would monitor more effectively the impact of political measures for the reduction of poverty are needed. The development of new specific indicators – national, 3rd level indicators – requires creation of new variables on the basis of the EU-SILC statistical surveys, household budget surveys, etc., which are now being prepared by the Statistical Office of the Slovak Republic (SOSR). Therefore, in comparison with the previously designed Project Fiche (PF), it is necessary to involve more final beneficiaries and to co-operate closely, especially with the SOSR. The previously defined IA on the level of activities has been changed in the newly drafted ToRs for the Technical Assistance (TA) assistance (number of officials trained on the use of the new national indicators) but it remains realistic and measurable without any influence on the relevance of the project or its implementation.

Component 2 Heath Care

10. The 2005 Working Time is a highly relevant intervention. The relevance is given by a need for transformation of the old health system into a modern personnel policy, covering the working time organisation. As the old system was in place for a long time, the transition towards the new one requires time. The change process started with the transposition of relevant EC directives into Slovak legislation⁵, i.e. into the Labour Code and other laws. Although this has already taken place, the real implementation in daily practice is problematic and lags behind. The project should contribute to assuring adequate administrative capacities for the actual implementation of the directives at the central and regional levels through the provision of training, assistance in up-grading of relevant internal documents and preparation of a guide book. This project with all its activities is demand driven, as the management of the implementation of the directives and lack of training have been identified as weak points in the transformation process. The design and implementation of training activities might be rather demanding on logistics, as a relatively high number of participants are planned per seminar/workshop. However, the Ministry of Health (MoH) has extensive experience in the organisation of similar events and is confident about the organisation of sets of training under this project. The intervention will be supervised by the Steering Committee (SC) planned to meet on a quarterly basis.

11. The relevance of the 2005 Administrative Capacity can be evaluated positively. Slovakia is obliged to prepare the Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs, which is a duty of a Reference MS. Although the transposition of the *acquis* on the registration of medicines has been completed, its practical implementation still needs strengthening. The SIDC, which is a key institution in this area granting market authorisations for medicinal products based on the experts' assessments of the application, lacks personnel and administrative capacities in order to perform its tasks in this area. The need has been confirmed also by conclusions from the previous project of the SIDC that targeted a similar area. The bilateral Dutch project indicated that improvement of skills of both internal and external experts cooperating with the SIDC is imperative.

12. <u>2005 Transplantations</u> shows positive results in relevance, as it is directly linked to the EU Directive dealing with safety of tissues and cells and other related directives. Also support to transplantations is mentioned in the new Policy Manifesto, however, a national transplantation

⁵ Directives No. 93/104/EC, 2000/34/EC and 2003/88/EC in the field of working time organisation in the health sector.

strategy has not been approved at the time of this IE. As Slovakia is lagging behind in the rate of donations (compared to other EU countries, such as the Czech Republic), the EU support from a MS with a developed system of transplantations, including the Quality Management System (QMS) seems to be reasonable. The project is rather demanding with regard to sequencing and its implications for tendering, as under the TW also ToRs for the TA part are to be drafted. However its 2-year duration provides some room for manoeuvre. Establishment of two Working Groups (WG) seems to be reasonable, due to the two main target groups of the project, namely tissue establishments and organ transplants centres, as well as the SC including all key stakeholders. Unlike other projects under review in this IE, the available IAs on the purpose level are well defined, with only the baseline missing (and to be defined as a result of the kick-off meeting discussions).

13. 2005 Monitoring of Drugs seems to be relevant, as it complies with the EU Strategy for FAD for the years 2005-2012, particularly in the area of monitoring of the DRD. Also Slovakia as a new member of the European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction (EMCDDA) has now new reporting obligations to comply with. The project should assist the previously under-developed forensic medical toxicology in Slovakia to catch up with the EU standards. This should be reached via enhancement of the equipment and establishment of the National Reference Laboratory (NRL) in Bratislava and the network of co-operating labs country wide, thus the project as such is demand driven. The design seems to have a logical architecture, combining Supply and Twinning Light (TWL) components. The sequencing is key again, as first the equipment needs to be supplied, being followed up by a series of theoretical and practical training. The last stage of the project includes pilot monitoring and reporting activities. However, the logical sequencing has not been made conditional in the available PF. The project implicitly presumes co-operation with the National Focal Point at the Office of the Government (OoG), being member of the SC and the future user of the outcomes of the forensic analysis when reporting to EMCDDA on one of the 5 key indicators.

2.2. Efficiency

Component 1 Human Resource Development

14. The implementation of the 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis has been delayed. The delay has an administrative character determined by the adoption of the new procurement law and by the implementation of a new selection method, i.e. a competitive dialogue, which proved to be rather lengthy. Also the start-up of the project has been relatively slow and accompanied by administrative and technical difficulties. During its first weeks the project did not have an own office, no documents were available in English and the availability of the assistant to the team leader was limited. There is scope for improvement in the organisation, cooperation and communication within the project team. The team members work individually from their own work-place elsewhere and meet once a month in order to discuss the progress made. As the Slovak experts do not use English actively, communication and cooperation with the team leader is limited. Also translation of reports and other project documents from Slovak into English takes place with a delay, or even at the last moment, which leaves only limited scope for commenting by the team leader. The project activities are implemented according to the approved inception report, although some questions related to the time planning of the

selection of the regional offices' representatives and their consequent training could be raised⁶. Cooperation and communication between the SNCHR and the Office of Government/Department of the Human Rights, and the SNCHR and the contractor is adequate. The SC comes together to discuss crucial issues of the project on a monthly basis and functions properly.

15. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming support has managed to conclude the TW contract on time (in November last year), despite earlier delays. When assessing the performance of the TW, notably the good conversion of inputs into outputs, this has been successfully achieved also due to the right selection of the TW partners (France and Germany), benefiting from the long-lasting experience of these respective MSs. The clear split of responsibilities among the Resident Twinning Adviser (RTA), short-term experts and the local staff responsible for the implementation of activities, together with a strong policy advice from the side of the MoLSAF (the Slovak Project Leader), has led to good operational and financial management of the project, which can be seen in the achieved results. Due to the efficient co-operation of the TW team with the local representatives, additional activities initiated by the local stakeholders were organised. Though the RTA team has suffered from problems of frequent re-location of the office (due to the insufficient number of offices (rooms) at the MoLSAF, the RTA staff was asked several times to move the office to various places within or even outside the Ministry), the encountered problems were solved without any negative implications on the achievement of the project result. The quality of all the reports submitted by the RTA was good and could serve also the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) purposes, as they, comprised a detailed description of each individual activity; indicated the achieved outputs, results and also the respective recommendations for the Beneficiary.

16. The 2005 National Indicators intervention has not started yet, due to the lengthy designing of the ToRs. This delay was caused by personal changes within the Social Inclusion Department, which is responsible for the contentual fulfilment of objectives. It is expected that the tender procedures will be launched only in the second quarter of this year. Compared to the previous time, the co-operation between the Phare and the TF Department and the Social Inclusion Department at the MoLSAF has been substantially improved at the end of the previous year by the appointment of the new Director of Phare Dept, which has also resulted in designing and submitting the respective ToRs for the discussion to the Central Finance and Contracting Unit (CFCU).

Component 2 Heath Care

17. The 2005 Working Time, delayed for more than a year, was at the tendering phase at the time of this evaluation. The project is logically designed for inputs to be converted into outputs, combining training with a parallel application of learnt know-how in up-grading of internal documents and organisational structures for health-care providers, and the preparation of a guidebook at the end. The experience and confidence of the TWL partner in successful facilitation of the organisation of a set of specialised training for relatively large numbers of participants⁷ from the whole country, as well as a direct implementation of learnt know-how in updating of their internal documents and organisational structures, indicates and requires an efficient project implementation.

-

⁶ The representatives will be selected and meet with the SNCHR already on 6 February, while the first round of training takes place in the period 26-30 March, which is almost 7 weeks later.

⁷ Target group 1 will consist of 340 participants and target group 2 of 320 participants.

- 18. The 2005 Administrative Capacity, delayed for almost 1.5 years, was at the tendering phase at the time of this Report. However, even the later implementation will still bring the valuable expertise for the preparation of the Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs to the SIDC. The SIDC possesses sufficient absorption capacity for the TWL project and has already undertaken initial activities in this area by collecting relevant information and background documents needed for the preparation of the Assessment Reports.
- 19. The 2005 Transplantations: After delegation of responsibilities with regard to project management from the central level of the Project Unit for Foreign Aid at the MoH to individual institutions and beneficiaries (based on the CFCU request), some concerns exist that the demanding 2005 PF assistance would occupy too much capacity of the top specialists of the Slovak Medical University (SMU) and the Bratislava University Hospital. Also the final beneficiary was informed about the form of the TF assistance, notably the TW only at the late stage of the pre-implementation phase. It is quite surprising that even at the post-accession stage; the Italian TW has suffered from problems in setting-up the RTA office, especially as regards the adequate office equipment. Another problem could be foreseen with regard to the implementation of the training activities, as travel and accommodation costs or per diems for potential participants coming from outside Bratislava were not covered under the project, nor have allocations from local sources been made (though the beneficiaries had confirmed ensurance of all the necessary resources for the project to the MoH prior to its start). For the audit phase of the TW the lack of local financial sources has been overcome via sending the MS experts to the respective facilities but for the training part the problem was not solved at the time of this IE.
- 20. 2005 Monitoring of Drugs: due to the well-known reasons for the late contracting of 2005 TF projects, the start of the project activities has been delayed. Also the rather specific character of the equipment needed for the NRL required more time when finalising the relevant Technical Specification (TS). However, the potential group of the bidders, as well as TWL partners has been already identified, which could speed up the tendering process. The cooperation with the Foreign Aid Project Unit at the MoH can be assessed as positive in preparation of the project. On the other hand, the management authority of toxicological labs in Slovakia, namely the Health Care Surveillance Authority, seems to play a rather passive role in the project.

2.3. Effectiveness

Component 1 Human Resource Development

21. The <u>2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis</u> can report the very first tangible results, such as the completion of the regional needs assessment, including a proposal for the establishment of 7 regional offices with concrete locations. The needs assessment has been accepted by the SNCHR and the initial objections on the size of the sample of actual respondents were dealt with. Furthermore, the first steps in the establishment of the network of partners at the regional level have been made. In the area of publicity, 2 articles at the national and regional level were published and building of the website has been initiated. Therefore, we expect that when established, staffed, trained, and integrated into the system of monitoring and enforcing the

principle of equal treatment, the network of 7 offices should *strengthen the institutional and administrative capacity of the SNCHR*.

22. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming project is considered as highly beneficial for the involved stakeholders, especially on the level of the national decision-making process (on the ministerial level). The GMC headed by the Minister of Labour, Social Affaires and Family is to be created at the cut off the date of this IE. The achieved mandatory results of the first TW component could be reported in the form of reshaping the Department for Gender Policy and Family into a new Dept. for Gender Quality and Anti-discrimination Policies, including the increase of the staff by 8 persons. Under the training component during the delivery of the first two modules more than 350 participants were trained (instead of 300). The core group of trainees has started to disseminate the gained knowledge and skills during the third module focused on designing of the project proposals aimed at gender inequalities (the list of the projects is published on the Gender Website as well). Additional 2 training sessions (originally not planned) for the National Labour Inspectorates, as well as NGOs located in the Kosice region were organised. Also the Training of Trainers (ToT) has helped to prepare the group of representatives on the national and local levels, which has resulted in establishment of Focal Points (gender contact persons) at the relevant ministries, as well as Higher Territorial Units (HTU) responsible for the new gender agenda. The effectiveness of the communication component is clearly visible on the Website located on the independent server (www.gender.gov.sk), providing complex information on the gender agenda, including the 2004 TF outcomes. From the above mentioned we can conclude, that the defined Immediate Objectives (IO) were achieved by setting up a gender mainstreaming co-ordination body and enhancing implementing capacities, which was also announced during the final conference in November 2006 by the Minister of Labour, Social Affairs and Family.

23. Once implemented, we can assume that the 2005 National Indicators project should fulfil the respective IO, which is defined as *creation of third level indicators of poverty and social exclusion regarding the national particularities to complement the Common Laeken Indicators.* The achievement of the project purpose should enable the SR to possess its own set of national indicators, which would correctly show the real state of poverty and social inclusion, including the fully reflected specific policy measures. The highly professional preparation process of the tender documentations should assure this. However, the construction of the second respective IA does not allow its use for evaluation purposes (see Annex 1).

Component 2 Heath Care

- 24. As the <u>2005 Working Time</u> project has not been implemented yet, no concrete effects can be reported. However, due to its design and importance for the MoH we can predict a positive contribution of this TF assistance to *strengthening human capacities responsible for Human Resources within the health sector to implement the relevant EU Directives*. As a result, more than 600 participants from the whole country and different, national and regional health care bodies should be trained, as well as internal documents and organisational structures of health care providers should be updated according to the gained know-how.
- 25. The <u>2005 Administrative Capacity</u> project is in its pre-implementation phase. Therefore, we can only make projections of the achievement of the respective IO. If successfully delivered, the trained SIDC coordinators, external clinical/non-clinical assessors and

pharmaceutical assessors should be able to prepare good quality Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs in line with the Directive 2001/83/EC Art. 18.

26. 2005 Transplantation: After implementation of all the planned activities, especially in the form of the completion of the quality management guide and the relevant training (after securing the adequate participation), together with the development of the unified Information System (IS) of tissue establishments and organ transplants centres, we are reasonably positive in predicting the fulfilment of the respective IO aimed at *introducing quality management for organ transplantation, tissue and cell banking, to assure the highest possible level of public health protection*. Also the public awareness campaign should contribute to the increase of the number of donors as requested in the corresponding IA (however, the baseline of the IA – necessary for evaluation purposes - is lacking).

27. 2005 Monitoring of Drugs From the design it appears to be logical to presume that the 2005 intervention will contribute to the stated IO to strengthen the Laboratory of the Forensic-Medical Toxicology to be established and accredited as the NRL, in the form of the delivery of the state-of-the-art equipment and the relevant training for the laboratory staff, once successfully implemented. However, at the time of this evaluation the concrete steps in obtaining the accreditation were not clear, nor was it clear which institution would do the accreditation.

2.4. Sustainability

Component 1 Human Resource Development

28. Ensuring sustainability of the 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis might be a challenge. Despite the fact that the project deals with this issue in the activity VIII, focused on the elaboration of a strategy to sustain and develop the regional offices, the sustainability remains a critical aspect of the project's success. The project activity focuses on acquiring financing outside the state budget, which is a healthy approach but might be a rather challenging task for the new offices and their representatives. Moreover, each office will be staffed just with one person, which leaves no scope for a substitution in case of need (i.e. sickness) and may represent a threat to continuation of activities.

29. Expectations of sustainability of the 2004 Gender Mainstreaming are very positive, which could be expressed also by several sustainable outcomes, such as the setting up of the institutional framework strategy of gender mainstreaming at the MoLSAF. Also the availability of the developed methodological training modules contributes to the positive assessment of the project's sustainability. Another sustainable element could be seen in the form of the NAP (developed by the TW team), which includes also an implementation schedule and financial arrangements, which should be submitted by the MoLSAF to the Government for an approval this year. Moreover, the new Policy Manifesto has declared the aim to create the institutional structures for assertion of gender equality issues in all policies and decisions that are being adopted within the framework of decision-making process, which could be interpreted as a positive signal for the creation of the Slovak gender mainstreaming structure – the GMC managed by the Minister of Labour, Social Affairs and Family and at the same time the most important outcome on the purpose level to secure the sustainability of the whole TF project. On

the other hand, for the Gender Website to be fully sustainable its regular update and maintenance are required, and this was not secured at the time of this IE.

30. With regard to the 2005 National Indicators project we can forecast good perspectives for maintaining the sustainability of its future outcomes. For instance, a solid ownership of the project exists from the side of the MoLSAF, as well as the SOSR. Also the MoLSAF will use the Common Laeken (national 3rd indicators,) – once developed under the 2005 TF assistance – regularly when preparing the NAP for Social Inclusion for the next years, as required by the EC. Moreover, in the second NAP/Inclusion it will be necessary to evaluate the implementation of political measures by common and national indicators on poverty and social inclusion (also developed under the TF intervention). Starting permanent monitoring, with the possibility of using the indicators in defining quantifiable targets and evaluation of the individual policy measure in the NAP/Inclusion, should contribute clearly to the future sustainability of the project's outputs.

Component 2 Heath Care

- 31. The assistance under the 2005 Working Time project should bring sustainable results, which are related to the implementation of the QMS in the health sector. According to Slovak Law, each service provider is obliged to implement the QMS as of 1 January 2007. Human Resources have a crucial place in this system. The system covers, among others, also information on the organisational structure of the institution, its rules, responsibilities, competencies, duties, etc., which should be developed under supervision of this project.
- 32. Sustainability of the results of the <u>2005 Administrative Capacity project</u> is determined by the EU legislation, according to which the Slovak Republic should become a Reference MS. This duty, including the process of the preparation of the Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs, is reflected in the QMS of the SIDC.
- 33. 2005 Transplantations: It was too early to evaluate sustainability of the 2005 assistance, as for instance, the accreditation of the relevant tissue and organs facilities is to be done only later this year. However, some concerns with regard to sustainability of some parts of the TF intervention exist, especially in securing maintenance of the IS and also suitability and availability of the complementary Hardware (HW) (including the server). In addition, sustainability of the training activities should be secured by the feedback assessment done by the experts, and also via the inclusion of the content of the training and the corresponding guidebook into the curricula of the SMU for distance learning.
- 34. 2005 Monitoring of Drugs Forecasts of sustainability of the 2005 assistance show mixed results. The Laboratory of the Forensic-Medical Toxicology in Bratislava seems to possess stable and experienced staff to perform the future role of the NRL. However, regional differences exist when evaluating the quality and stability of staff as a sustainability criterion. Also the present network of 11 forensic-medical laboratories could change in the future as a result of a health care reform. The idea of creating 3 regional labs and 8 with basic functions in monitoring DRD has not materialised at the time of this IE. The first sign of sustainability should be reported once the Bratislava laboratory is accredited later this year (to be the subject of the second round of IE).

2.5. Impact

Component 1 Human Resource Development

- 35. The 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis has the potential to generate a wider impact in society, as it may contribute to a gradual change of mentality of people and the culture generally by informing and making them aware of their rights and evoking an assertive approach in this respect. The regional dimension of the project ensures that the offices will be close to individuals in need of such services. Consequently, we expect that the project has a potential to 'increase the capability of the SR to monitor and enforce the principle of equal treatment', as defined in its WO.
- 36. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming intervention has contributed to its broader impact when reaching a substantial number of trainees (more than 300), who had learnt how to implement the gender mainstreaming policy and some of them later transferred the gained knowledge into the development of the gender project proposals (the list of project proposals is visible on the Gender Website). The effective transfer of know-how, together with the ToT multiplication effects (12 disseminating issues of gender mainstreaming policy at the relevant ministries and HTUs), as well as a solid methodological base (manuals of good practise - 850 copies, a doctrine document, the NAP) show clearly the contribution of the 2004 TF assistance to the fulfilment of the corresponding Wider Objective (WO) ...developing the methodology to implement gender mainstreaming principles in practise. Setting up the GMC also positively contributed to the fulfilment of the respective WO aimed at strengthening administrative structures in the field of gender mainstreaming, when introducing the relevant staff operating as Focal Points at individual ministries and structures of regional self-governance (HTU) with the relevant know-how, and through networking of all the relevant stakeholders (including NGO's, social partners, etc.), who are now directly responsible for the implementation of horizontal principles of equal opportunities. The development of the communication strategy and its implementation has contributed to wider overall effects concerning the dissemination of project outcomes, when measured via a number of visitors of the relevant Website (more than 40 000) at the cut-off of the IE.
- 37. The 2005 National Indicators project, once successfully implemented, will definitely have an impact when measured via its contribution to the defined WO *improvement of monitoring framework of the social inclusion process*. For instance, the reference manual, including the methodology for the calculation of the national indicators, will be used for setting up the framework of regular monitoring of the socially excluded groups. Also the evaluation of the implementation of the political measures on poverty and social inclusion on the national level to be presented to the EC should contribute to the full implementation of the EU-SILC. The project has a potential to result in a broader impact in the form of the reduced poverty in Slovakia, once this is more effectively monitored.

Component 2 Heath Care

38. The <u>2005 Working Time</u> TWL via its training activities and application of obtained knowhow in updating of internal documents and organisational structures of health care providers, as

well as the elaboration of guidebook expected to be broadly used, should contribute to the improvement of the structure and the increase of the effectiveness of the utilisation of health professional capacities within the health sector in the Slovak Republic. An illustration of a potential impact could be the elimination of shortages of physicians/specialists by adjusting their working time so that not all of them will be working in just one shift but will be spread over all shifts. Such an adjustment should result in a better service to and a higher satisfaction of patients.

- 39. The 2005 Administrative Capacity has a potential to bring a broader impact in the form of an increased free movement (trade) of pharmaceuticals after acceptance of the Slovak Republic as a Reference Member State. Overall, the 2005 assistance should contribute to its WO focused on strengthening of the administrative capacity of the SIDC to implement the Directives and Regulations⁸ related to free movement of goods, including the renewal of all marketing authorisations for pharmaceuticals on the Slovak market.
- 40. The 2005 Transplantations assistance should have some positive impact on the enhanced quality and safety of donations (as defined in the respective Wider Objective (WO)), when introducing a complex QMS. Also a substantial number of the staff of the network of establishments should be trained (around 100) to perform their roles better, together with the functioning Information System (IS). However, for the project to have a broader impact, substantial financial resources need to be invested into the transplantation programme for it to be successful, as can be seen in the positive examples of some MSs (such as Spain or Italy).
- 41. We can only make some early predictions of the fulfilment of the 2005 Monitoring of <u>Drugs</u> WO requesting high quality of monitoring and reporting on DRD to comply with the EMCDDA key indicators. After implementation of all the planned activities, the 2005 project should have a positive impact on the improved performance of the analytical work of the forensic labs and the quality of the data provided to the National Monitoring Centre for Drugs at the OoG, performing the function of the National Focal Point and further monitoring on DRD to EMCCDA, thus performing also the full membership obligations.. Moreover, via training of almost all relevant lab staff (about 20) in Slovakia, the project should have a broader impact on the forensic medicine as a whole and bring it closer to EU standards and international acceptance. However, to improve the reputation of the forensic medicine, more attention from the side of the managing authority, together with further investments into equipment would be needed.

2.6 Specific Issues

42. There were no specific issues during this IE.

Directives 2001/83/EC, 2004/27/EC, 2004/24/EC and 2003/63/EC and the Regulations EC No. 1084/2003, 2309/93, 726/2004.

3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

3.1 Relevance

- 43. The **HRD** projects are relevant as they cover the needs identified in the respective policy documents, such as the prevention of and dealing with discrimination in the <u>2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis</u>, the implementation of gender equality in the <u>2004 Gender Mainstreaming</u> and the EU Regulation related to the Community statistics on income and living conditions under the <u>2005 National Indicators</u> project. For the first time in the Slovak history gender quality appears as a specific and a well-identified objective of the general policy as presented in the new Policy Manifesto. As in the past, some of the projects are clearly overambitious, such as the <u>2004 Gender Mainstreaming</u> TW with a number of activities planned at the national, regional, local as well as international levels for a broad audience of beneficiaries and a heavy need for a strong logistical support. Consequently, a demanding design required good absorption and management capacities, which seemed to cause some difficulties, and which resulted also in the 2nd addendum focused on the prolongation of the TW.
- 44. The HC projects show good results with regard to their relevance, with clear linkages to the respective EU documents, such as the EU Directives and Regulations on improvement of health and safety at work and registration of medicines; and the EU strategy for FAD that would require a focused project management, including the tendering stage.

3.2 Efficiency

- 45. Assessment of the efficiency of the evaluated **HRD** projects shows in general good results or perspectives in transformation of individual activities into results; however, delays in the start of the activities were reported when compared to the original PFs. However, there might be scope for the improvement of the efficiency in the organisation, communication and cooperation within the project team under the 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis project. This holds especially for the frequency of the internal meetings of the project team (TL and experts), active communication of the project team in English and ensuring the timely provision of essential information in English. The implementation of the 2004 Gender Mainstreaming project was efficient and no substantial problems occurred. The good quality of the day-to-day management in order to secure transformation of activities in appropriate time influenced positively the achievement of the intended results, together with the right selection of the TW partners. The sequencing of activities follows, in principle, the originally planned ones. The TW partners closely co-operated with the contractor developing the Website during preparations regarding the visibility of the project. After previous problems, the improved cooperation between the Phare and TF Department and the Social Inclusion Department at the MoLSAF resulted in designing and submitting the ToRs for discussion to the CFCU for the 2005 National Indicators project.
- 46. Efficiency of **HC** projects suffered from delays at the pre-implementation phase caused by a lengthy approval of the project documentation. This holds especially for the <u>2005 Working Time</u> and <u>2005 Administrative Capacity</u> projects. After delegation of responsibilities with regard to project management from the central level of the MoH to individual institutions and beneficiaries, some concerns exist with regard to sufficient capacities of top medical specialist to manage some HC projects, especially twinning ones, such as the 2005 Transplantations.

Also lack of resources to cover local costs connected with the participation at training activities puts at risk sufficient participation of potential trainees from outside Bratislava at the TW part of the same project.

The commitment and disbursement rates for the ESC Sector are rather poor; in particular, the 10 percent disbursement is rather worrying.

3.3 Effectiveness

47. The effectiveness of the **HRD** projects is satisfactory. The 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis has provided first tangible results accepted by the beneficiaries, despite some initial objections on the sample size of the needs assessment. The contractor initiated the selection of representatives of the 7 regional offices, which is one of the first steps in strengthening the institutional and administrative capacities of the SNCHR. The 2004 Gender Mainstreaming assistance has achieved the planned objectives. All the planned benefits were delivered to the key beneficiaries, such as training and transfer of know-how to both the members of the GMC as well as the focal points, introducing the methodology on the implementation the gender mainstreaming into practise, designing the doctrine document or introducing the Website. The 2005 National Indicators project is likely to achieve its objectives, even though it is at the pre-implementation phase. However, the construction of the second respective IA does not allow its use for evaluation purposes.

48. Even at the early stage of implementation or the pre-implementation phase, the good design of the projects suggest that there is a high probability that most of the **HC** projects will contribute to their respective IOs, such as strengthening human capacities responsible for Human Resources in the health sector, the Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs prepared in line with the EU requirements, introduction of the QMS for transplantations, the complementary SW and public awareness campaign or establishment of the NRL for medical toxicology in Bratislava. However, closer evaluation of this criterion can be done only during the second round of evaluation later this year.

3.4 Sustainability

49. Assessment of the sustainability of effects of the **HRD** projects shows mostly optimistic predictions, although that of the <u>Anti-discrimination Acquis</u> represents a challenge. This holds despite the fact that the project is dealing with this issue in one of its activities. Because of the importance and urgency of this topic, we would recommend that the contractor intensifies cooperation on this issue with the SNCHR and the OoG and together explore the possibility of partial financing from the state budget⁹, at least in the initial years of the functioning of the regional centers, where the OoG should provide policy assistance and support. Moreover, training on acquisition of funds and preparation of proposals for projects financed from Structural Funds should be developed and given to the representatives of the regional offices as a part of the training activity of the project. Under the <u>2004 Gender Mainstreaming</u> project 25 focal points should continue their work also after the completion of the TF project in the frame of the national and regional structures through the trained experts (more than 300). However, for the Gender Website to be fully sustainable, regular maintenance of the website it required

_

⁹ The representatives of the regional offices are full time regular employees of the SNCHR and should therefore be taken into account in the financial projections.

in order to disseminate updated information on the implementation of the mainstreaming policy. Financing for the maintenance was not secured at the time of this IE. The 2005 National Indicators intervention does not seem to have problems in maintaining sustainability of its outcomes. The MoLSAF as the responsible body for the elaboration of the NAP/ Inclusion should use the national indicators for permanent monitoring of policy measure impacts in the field of social inclusion, which at the same time confirms the potential ownership of the project and its objectives

50. Early observations of sustainability of **HC** projects show mixed results. While sustainability of the 2005 Working Time project and that of the 2005 Administrative Capacity project is positively determined by the implementation of the QMS in the health sector, complementary funding for the 2005 Transplantations project was not secured at the time of the IE for the maintenance of the IS or the corresponding HW. On the other hand sustainability of the training activities seems to be well assured. Also the future NRL for the 2005 Monitoring of Drugs possesses a stable and experienced staff; however concrete steps to obtain the accreditation were not fully clear at the time of the Report.

3.5 Impact

- 51. In general, the interventions implemented under the **HRD** projects should contribute to the achievement of their overall objectives. The 2004 Anti-discrimination Acquis has a potential to contribute to a gradual change of mentality of people by informing, making them aware about their rights, and increasing their assertive approach towards the issue. As the regional offices will be close to individuals, they are expected to increase the capability of the SNCHR to monitor and enforce the principle of equal treatment. For the 2004 Gender Mainstreaming project we can expect a positive impact, as a political acceptance exists for the gender equality agenda, which has been also officially declared in the new Policy Manifesto. The visible impact of the new political guidelines has some concrete outcomes, when for instance introducing the organisational changes at the MoLSAF. However, to measure the scope of the impact requires a longer process. The increase of awareness of the relevant ministry and public administration staff on the new gender agenda needs to be supported, the MoLSAF as a responsible institution could introduce a systematic training on gender mainstreaming into the general training system of the civil servants, as well as the public administration staff. The 2005 National Indicators should perform well in contributing to its impact, if Slovakia would be able to monitor more effectively the impact of political measures aimed at the reduction of poverty.
- 52. No big concerns exist for the impact of the **HC** projects and their contribution to the corresponding WOs, such as in the field of improvement of working time organisation, renewal of marketing authorisation for pharmaceuticals, the enhanced quality and safety of donations for transplantations or improved monitoring of the DRD. However, for a broader impact, substantial financial resources should be invested into the system as shown by the positive examples from other EU countries (especially in the area of transplantations).

Conclusion	Recommendation	Output	Reference/	Responsibility	Deadline
			Paragraph		
2004 Anti-discrimination Sustainability of the 7 regional offices of the SNCHR is a challenge and should be further improved.	The SNCHR and the OoG/Section of Human Rights and Minorities should, together with the contractor, explore possibilities for future financing of the 7 regional offices, including a partial financing from the state budget in the initial years of the existence of the regional offices, where the OoG should provide policy assistance and support. The SNCHR should consequently take corresponding actions in this area, i.e. approach the Ministry of Finance. Moreover, training on acquisition of funds and preparation of proposals for projects financed from Structural Funds should be developed and given to the representatives of the regional offices as a part of the training activity of the project.	Improved sustainability	28,49	SNCHR/OoG	asap
At the time of the IE maintenance of the Gender Website, developed under the TW assistance was not secured.	The MoLSAF should secure the maintenance of the Gender Website in order to disseminate updated information on the implementation of the gender mainstreaming policy.	Improved sustainability and impact	29,36,49,51	MoLSAF/Benef iciaries	asap
2004Gender Mainstreaming Sustainability and impact of the TF assistance could be improved, once the gender mainstreaming training is introduced broadly for relevant officials.	The MoLSAF should introduce a systematic training on gender mainstreaming into the general training system of the civil servants, as well as the public administration staff using also the strategic and methodological documents created by the Focal Points under the TF assistance.	Improved sustainability and impact	29,36,49,51	MoLSAF/Benef iciaries	
2005 Transplantations At the time of the IE financial resources were not secured for the complementary HW and maintenance of the IS.	The MoH together with beneficiaries of the 2005 Transplantations project should secure financial resources to cover costs of the complementary equipment (such as the server) and also maintenance costs of the SW created under the TF to secure sustainability of the project's outputs.	Improved sustainability	33,50	MoH/Beneficiar ies	asap
2005 Transplantations Sufficient participation at the TW training activities was put at risk due to lack of financial resources to cover travel, accommodation costs	The MoH together with beneficiaries of the 2005 Transplantation project should allocate adequate financial resources to secure participation at training activities for trainees from all of Slovakia.	Improved efficiency, effectiveness and impact	19,26,40,46,48,52	MoH/Beneficiar ies	

and per diems of potential			
participants (especially from			
outside of Bratislava).			

Performance rating

	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability	Impact	Verbal Rating
Human Resource	es Development					
2004/016-						
764.04.02	1	-1	1	-1	1	S
Anti-	1	-1	1	-1	1	S
discrimination						
2004/016-						
764.04.01	1	1	1	1	1	S
Gender	1	1	1	1	1	3
Mainstreaming						
2005/017-						
464.05.01	1				4	G
National	1	1	0	1	1	S
Indicators						
Health Care						
2005/017-						
464.05.02	2	0	0	0	1	S
Working Time						
2005/017-						
464.04.01	1	0	0	0	1	S
Medicinal	1	U	0	0	1	S
Products						
2005/017-						
464.04.03	1	0		0	1	C
Monitoring of	1	0	0	0	1	S
Drugs						
2005/017-						
464.04.02	1	-1	1	-1	1	S
Transplantation						
Total for the ESC Sector	1	0	1	0	1	S

Rating guide:

Unacceptable	Poor	Sufficient/ Adequate or no rating possible	Good	Excellent
-2	-1	0	+1	+2

Highly Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	No rating possible	Satisfactory	Highly satisfactory
HU	U	N/A	S	HS

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1 INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT

INDICATOR LEVEL	OBJECTIVES	INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS)	REMARKS			
COMPONENT 1 : HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT						
		for the implementation of the anti-discrimination acquis				
Project Purpose	Strengthening the institutional and administrative capacities of the Slovak National Center for Human Rights	7 offices fully integrated into the system of monitoring and enforcing the principle of equal treatment by January 2006	Valid, applicable as an indicator			
2004/016-764.	04.01 Gender Mainstreaming					
Project Purpose	Setting up a gender mainstreaming co- ordination body and enhancing implementing capacities	Implementation structures are in place	Non-measurable, not specific enough, non-quantifiable, not applicable as indicator			
2005/017-464.	05.01 National Indicators					
Project Purpose	Create third level indicators of poverty and social exclusion regarding the national particularities to complement the Common Laeken Indicators	 □ Required national poverty and exclusion indicators and methodology of their calculation available till 03/2006 □ Proposals for establishment of permanent monitoring available till 12/2006 				
	2 : HEALTH CARE					
2005/017-464.	05.02 Improvement of working time organ	nisation in the health sector	,			
Project Purpose	Strengthening of human capacities responsible for Human Resources within the health sector to implement the Directives No. 93/104/EC, 2000/34/EC and 2003/88/EC	The principles of the Directive introduced in the health care facilities tackled by this project by the end of the 2006	Non-measurable, not specific enough, non-quantifiable, not applicable as indicator			
2005/017-464.04.01 Strengthening the administrative capacity of the State Institute for Drug Control as regards medicinal products for human use						

Project Purpose	Strengthening of the administrative capacity of the State Institute for Drug Control (SIDC) to be able to prepare Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs	100% of all Final Assessment Reports and Public Assessment Reports accepted by the SIDC	The time dimension is missing, otherwise usable as an indicator	
2005/017-		ability of Organs, Tissues and Cells for Transplantation in the SR		
Project	Introducing quality management for organ transplantation, tissue and cell	☐ Increasing of the number of real donors from indicated donors by 10%	The time horizon is missing, otherwise usable as an indicator	
Purpose	banking, to assure the highest possible level of public health protection	□ Decreasing the number of insufficient organs by 5%	Baseline missing, otherwise usable as an indicator	
2005/017-464.04.03 Strengthening of National Monitoring of Drugs and Drug Abuse				
Project Purpose	To adjust and strengthen the Laboratory of the Forensic-Medical Toxicology (within the Institute of Forensic Medicine in Bratislava – Petržalka) to be established and accredited as the National Reference Laboratory - the main institution responsible for the necrotic toxicology within the established nationally coordinated system of the forensic medicine	☐ Fully functional NRL, providing on routine basis information on direct drug death according to NFP	Non-measurable, not valid as indicators	

ANNEX 2 LIST OF INTERVIEWS

INSTITUTION	INTERVIEWEE	DATE
The Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family of the SR Spitalska 4-6 SK 812 47 Partialses	Mr. Alain Laferté RTA	28 November 2006
SK-812 47 Bratislava The Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family of the SR Spitalska 4-6	Ms. Veronika Lopuova Project Manager	4 December 2006
SK-812 47 Bratislava Health Care Surveillance Authority Antolska 11	Mr. Juraj Mlynar	6 December 2006
SK-851 07 Bratislava State Institute for Drug Control Kvetna 11	Ms. Dagmar Stara* Head of the EU Registration	6 December 2006
SK-825 08 Bratislava 26 The Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family of the SR	Department Ms. Katarina Alexyova Project Manager	7 December 2006
Spitalska 4-6 SK-812 47 Bratislava Office of the Government SR General Secretariat of the Board of Ministers for Drug Dependencies and Drug Control	Ms. Dana Loziova* Project Manager	8 December 2006
Cukrova 14 SK-811 08 Bratislava The Ministry of Health SR Human Resources Department Limbova 2	Mrs. Miloslava Kovacova Director of the Human Resources Department	11 December 2006
SK-837 52 Bratislava Office of the Government of the SR Aid Co-ordination Unit Stefanikova 2	Ms. Sona Gabcova Programme Manager	11December 2006
SK-813 70 Bratislava The Slovak Medicine University Slovak Centre of Organs Transplants Limbova 12	Mr. Daniel Kuba Director	12 December 2006
SK-833 03 Bratislava The Ministry of Health SR Project Unit for Foreign Aid Limbova 2	Ms. Zuzana Pikulova SPO	12 December 2006
SK-837 52 Bratislava The Ministry of Health SR Project Unit for Foreign Aid Limbova 2	Ms. Iveta Krbatova Project Manager	12 December 2006
SK-837 52 Bratislava The Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family of the SR Social Inclusion Dept. Spitalska 4-6	Mrs. Viera Hanulakova Slovak Project Leader, Director	19 December 2006
SK-812 47 Bratislava University Hospital Bratislava Ruzinovska 6	Mr. Augusto Lauro RTA	20 December 2006
SK-821 02 Bratislava University Hospital Bratislava Ruzinovska 6	Mr. Jan Koller Project Manager	20 December 2006
SK-821 02 Bratislava The Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family of the SR Family and Gender Policy Dept. Špitálska 4-6 SK-812 47 Bratislava	Ms. Jana Tomatova Director	21 December 2006

Economic and Social Cohesion			Annex 2
Ministry of Finance SR	Mr. Miroslav Skvarka	11 January 2007	
Central Finance and Contracting Unit	Project Manager		
Stefanovicova 5			
SK-813 08 Bratislava			
Office of the Government of the SR	Ms. Denisa Kutyova	17 January 2007	
Aid Co-ordination Unit	Programme Manager		
Stefanikova 2			
SK-813 70 Bratislava			
Slovak National Center for Human Rights	Mrs. Daniela Gemerska	18 January 2007	
Kycerskeho 5	Deputy Director		
SK-811 05 Bratislava			
Slovak National Center for Human Rights	Mr. Tomas Foldes	18 January 2007	
Kycerskeho 5	Head of Education to Human		
SK-811 05 Bratislava	Rights and Project Management		
	Section		
Office of the Government of the SR	Ms. Marianna Milcakova	18 January 2007	
Aid Co-ordination Unit	Programme Manager		
Stefanikova 2			
SK-813 70 Bratislava			
Ministry of Finance SR	Ms. Zora Paulikova*	18 January 2007	
Central Finance and Contracting Unit	Project Manager		
Stefanovicova 5			
SK-813 08 Bratislava			
Euroformes	Mr. Peter Kostolny	19 January 2007	
Vysokoskolakov 4	Deputy Director		
SK-010 08 Zilina			
Office of the Government of the SR	Ms. Lubica Zajacova*	24 January 2007	
Section of Human Rights and Minorities	SPO		
Department of Project Coordination			
Stefanikova 2			
SK-813 70 Bratislava	35 7 00 00	247 2005	
Office of the Government of the SR	Mr. Jozef Sevcik*	24 January 2007	
Section of Human Rights and Minorities	Project manager		
Department of Project Coordination			
Stefanikova 2			
SK-813 70 Bratislava	M. V. V. L. I	24 1	
Euroformes	Mrs. Veronike Lasserre-Fy*	24 January 2007	
Vysokoskolakov 4	Team Leader		
SK-010 08 Zilina			
* Telephone interview.			

ANNEX 3 LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION

Name of Originator	Date	Title of Document	
Euroformes, Dominus, Dafne	11 January 2007	Inception Report Development of Regional Structures for the Implementation of the Anti-discrimination Acquis	
Euroformes, Dominus, Dafne	11 January 2007	Monthly Report: 1-30 November 2006 Development of Regional Structures for the Implementation of the Anti-discrimination Acquis	
European Commission	2003	Comprehensive Monitoring Report on Slovakia's Preparedness for the EU Membership	
European Commission	2004	Commission Decision of Financial Contribution of Transition Facility for Strengthening Institutional Capacity to the Slovak Republic	
European Commission/Office of the Government SR	August 2004	Memorandum of Understanding on the Implementation of the TF 2004 – 2006 (in Slovak only)	
European Commission	2004	Planning Document Transition Facility 2004-2006, Slovak Republic	
European Commission	December 2003	Programming and Implementation Guide – Transition Facility	
European commission/Office of the Government SR	2004-2005	Project Fiches for TF Programmes 2004 and 2005	
European Commission/Office of the Government	July 2006	Financial Proposal on the Implementation of the TF 2006	
Office of the Government SR	December 2006	Implementation Status Report	
MWH Consortium	June 2006	Phare and CBC ex-post evaluation 1999-2001	
Ministry of Finance SR	September 2006	Financial Tables for TF 2004 and 2005 Programmes	
Office of the Government SR	August 2006	Government's Manifesto	
Office of the Government/Aid Co-ordination Unit	November 2006	Minutes from the SMSC - JHA	
CFCU	January 2007	Financial and Contractual data for the Sector	
CFCU/Consortium of Member	October 2006	Twinning contract Nr. SK 2004/IB/SO/01 including	
State Partner		addenda and monitoring reports	
CEEN/Euroformes	December 2006	Country Interim Evaluation Summary	
Ministry of Health Italy/CFCU November 2006		Twinning Contract Nr. SK05/IB/SO/02	
Office of the Government/CFCU	March 2006	Memorandum of Understanding for the Grant Scheme 2004/16-764-03-02 Support to the Implementation of the National Programme for the Fight against Drugs 2004-2008	

Documents requested but not made available (with reasons): none

Economic and Social Cohesion Annex 4

ANNEX 4 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS INTERIM EVALUATION

Interim Evaluation ReportR/SR/ESC/0306, issued on 19 September 2006

Components covered:

- Structural Funds Institutional Building
- Small and Medium-size Enterprise Support
- Regional Development, Cross Border Co-operation Investment and Joint Small Project Fund
- Roma Minority
- Human Resource Development and European Social Fund Preparation
- Health Care

Recommendation	Applied (Yes/No)	Responsibility for Follow-up	Deadline	Details of Action/ Remarks/Update
The CSF and MAs should propose a final decision on the division of the evaluation tasks and responsibilities, and encourage the establishment of a dialogue with the potential Slovak research bodies and/or qualified consultants.	Yes	CSF, MAs	With immediate effect	Evaluation processes of Structural Funds and the Cohesion Fund will be coordinated by the Ministry of Construction and Regional Development. Negotiations with the Statistical Office and relevant research bodies/experts are in the process.
MoH in co-operation with the Public Health Authority should estimate the required funds and identify the sources to secure funding for the effective operation of the software system.	Yes	MoH, Public Health Authority	With immediate effect	Additional staff was allocated to deal with the software. The need for funds is being estimated but their allocation will also depend in the agreement with the company which has developed the software. A letter to be drafted by the Ministry of Health early 2007 to the Director of the Public Health Authority stressing, that it is the responsibility of the Authority to secure the funding for the operation of the software. In addition, the Ministry of Health is searching additional sources to be allocated for the sustainability of the software.
For Roma projects the concerned implementing bodies should ensure that the pilot nature is respected and results are carried through into practice after physical completion of projects. In order to fully utilise the experience from these projects formal arrangements should be put in place as soon as possible.	Yes	MoEd, MoH	With immediate effect	Discussions were held during the year 2006 between the Ministry of Health and Public Health Authority (PHA) regarding the sustainability of the Phare project 2003-004-995-01-06 and its major component <i>Health Field Workers</i> . A framing Scheme for the implementation of these field workers into system of work of regional PHAs was prepared. Moreover, during the meeting of Ministerial State Secretary and deputy PHA Director with Roma NGO representatives (September 2006), the State Secretary and deputy PHA Director supported continuation and sustainability of the system. The scheme prepared by the PHA SR was under intensive discussion within the different sections of the MoH in the end of year 2006.

Economic and Social Cohesion

Annex 4

As a result, some comments and improvements were included in to the original material. The MoH has allocated about SKK 6 m in the 2007 budget to finance this program. In parallel, the MoH has planned to combine the state budget financing with the new structural funds in cooperation with Ministry of Social Affairs, to reach a bigger impact. In spite of positive approach of the Ministry of Social Affairs at the beginning of the communication, the cooperation unfortunately failed. Therefore MoH initiated joined meeting with Ministry of Social Affairs and Plenipotentiary office to reach agreement in January 2007, which, however failed again. The Public Health Authority is preparing a document to be submitted also to the Government, which includes an intention to commence the support system. Nevertheless, the project will be implemented at least in a limited form. The MoEd, within its competencies, transmits the recommendations of the projects to relevant sectoral strategies and connected regulations. The results of the projects are reflected in the National Plan of Human Rights Education 2005 – 2014, developed in the frame of the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education (2005 – 2014, that involves all institutions governed by the MoEd.The MoEd also enacts relevant regulations and yearly passes actualised Pedagogic-Organization Instructions for schools, all of them published at the Ministry web-pages. The project output materials are open to wide public, easily accessible at the Ministry web and, according to the needs, regularly published and distributed to schools/institutions also in the written form. The MoEd delegated tasks connected with the continuance of projects to its expert units (organisations governed by the MoEd). For the 2002 Roma project, the MoEd has enacted a directive taking effect from 1 January 2007 (concerning classes enabling children to integrate into standard primary schools from special primary schools) and the instruction of using projects output materials in this process. The r
output materials of the project were distributed to schools in need nationwide.

ANNEX 5 SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION

Component 1 Human Resource Development

2004/016-764.04.02 Development of Improved Regional Structures for the Implementation of the Anti-discrimination acquis

The project consists of the TA part focused on the institutional building and two supply contract for the delivery of IT and office equipment (Euro 30,000) and regional offices' running costs and salaries (Euro 70,000). The supply contracts will be financed by the national co-financing. The institution building TA focuses on the establishment of 7 functional regional offices of the Slovak National Center for Human Rights. The kick-off meeting took place on 31 October 2006 and the first project activities, such as the needs assessment, publication of two articles and an advertisement, and the preparation of the selection of representatives of the regional offices took place.

2004/016-764.04.01 Strengthening of Administrative Capacities in the Field of Gender Mainstreaming

The project was designed as a TW. The main line of the TW was taking the advantage from the experience of two old MSs (French and Germany) in order to promote the gender quality in Slovakia, where administration and civil society are less familiarised with such an approach. The French TW in consortium with the German MS partner started the performance of the designed activities on 19th October, 2005. The introductory kick off meeting was held on December 13, 2005 supported by the attendance from highlevel public officials including the MoLSAF Minister. The performance of activities through 3 individual components was prolonged by an amendment till November 2006. The activities were successfully carried out. The TW team has developed the required gender mainstreaming methodology, including recommendations how to improve its implementation, provided numerous training sessions for more than 300 participants, including additional trainings (2 individual trainings, training of trainers and 3 training modules delivered on the national and regional levels), organised 2 study visits for 20 participants and enabled the Slovak representatives to study, compare and introduce into practise the implementation of the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy. The global communication strategy was designed, published and implemented via the activities of the third component, resulted into creation and setting up the Website comprised of structured information dealing with the gender mainstreaming issue. The Website www.gender.gov.sk was fully operational, reflected in the increasing number of visitors (40 000) at the cut off date of the IE. The training guide and materials were designed, printed and disseminated to all participants involved, responsible for the implementation and co-ordination of the gender mainstreaming policy in Slovakia. Conference events were organised. The participation of both MoLSAF Ministers (the previous and the current) during the 2 conference events has confirmed that the gender mainstreaming issue is to be seen as the highest priority of this sector. Members of the Focal Points comprised of state civil servants and public administration responsible for co-ordination of gender policy in Slovakia have been appointed and started to implement the GMS (as visible at the Website). The TW intervention was completed on 30th November 2006.

2005/017-464.05.01 Creation of National Indicators in the Field of Poverty and Social Exclusion (the Tertiary Indicators)

The project aims at improvement of monitoring framework for assessment of the social inclusion process. The TF assistance will be delivered as a local TA. The first draft of the ToRs has been developed and submitted for comments to the CFCU late December 2006 (delay of more than one year in comparison to the ToR's implementation schedule). The ongoing pre-implementation phase is culminating with the finalising of the tender documentation. The TA should provide the following activities: (i) studying legislative and policy documents on measures in the social inclusion area and possibilities of statistical surveys executed in Slovakia (ii) working out an analytical study focused on analysis of national indicators measuring poverty in Slovakia and the EU member states (iii) selecting and proposing the most suitable indicators (iv) preparation and performance of the survey resulted in reports on the results (v) working out the reference manual, training of 30 on the utilisation of the new national indicators officials and organising of final conference.

Component 2 Health Care

2005/017-464.05.02 Improvement of Working Time in the Health Sector

This TWL project has been being tendered at the moment of this evaluation. The TWL partner is the MoH, responsible for the overall supervision of the project. The MoH is one of the recipients together with various health care facilities, including 8 local self-governments and municipalities. The monitoring and supervision of the project will be carried out by a SC. The project should provide training to the personnel of the MoH, regional self-governments and health care facilities, dealing with the human resource development in the health sector. On the basis of training internal documents of the participating institutions should be up-graded and at the end a guidebook of recommendations for management of human resources within the health sector prepared.

2005/017-464.04.01 Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of the State Institute for Drug Control as regards Medicinal Products for Human Use

The TWL is in the pre-implementation phase and has been tendered during this evaluation. The TWL partner is the MoH. The MoH is also the beneficiary institution; the final recipient is the SIDC. The project aims at strengthening of the administrative capacity of the SIDC that should be able to prepare Assessment Reports of Registration documents of human drugs in accordance with the EU legislation and requirements. The

core project activities relate to training of SIDC's coordinators, assessors, top management and lawyers and should result in the preparation of high quality Final Assessment Report and the Public Assessment Report.

2005/017-464.04.02 Improvement of the Safety, Quality, Availability of Organs, Tissues and Cells for Transplantation in the Slovak Republic

Via a combination of a TW and a TA auditing of the implementation of the quality systems in the health sector will be carried out, the quality management system for transplantation centres introduced together with the relevant guide, the relevant staff trained, an IS for transplantation centres implemented and tested and a brochure and an information leaflet on tissue, cells and organs donation produced. The TW part has started with the inception phase early December 2006. The introductory kick-off meeting was held mid January 2007. The RTA should prepare the ToRs for the TA part later this year and its tendering to commence then consequently.

2005/017-464.04.03 Strengthening of National Monitoring of Drugs and Drug Abuse The project consists of a TWL and a Supply. Under the TWL a series of seminars and workshops for employees of forensic toxicological laboratories in provision of analytical results for the EMCDDA indicator in the area of drug-related death. MS experts to provide at the same time methodological manuals for about 20 participants of the workshops. Under the TWL also the 3-month pilot tested of the data collection system on DRD indicator to be provided by the NRL and forensic medical toxicological laboratories. The supply sub-project the NRL should be equipped with special equipment for analysis of the autopsy biological samples, together with the related information materials in the form of books and publications.

The tendering of the Supply part has started end December 2006 and the TWL should be launched later in 2007.

ANNEX 6 DISSENTING VIEWS

There were no dissenting views